



Agenda | Regular Meeting | Final City of Bend Accessibility Advisory Committee (COBAAC)

Thursday, February 24, 2022, 1:00 to 2:30 pm
Held virtually via Zoom

1. Call to Order & Introductions

Chairperson Radon Called the City of Bend Accessibility Advisory Committee (COBAAC) virtual meeting to order at 1:03 pm

Members Present:

Chairperson Radon, Kori Sparks (she/her), Ashley Schahfer, Amanda Hamer, John Heylin (left at 2:20 pm),

Members Absent:

Jeff Lichtenberg, Frank Shirley, and Ashley Mohni

City of Bend Staff:

- Cherissa Alldredge (she/her/hers) | Accessibility & Equity Manager | COBAAC Liaison | DEIA Dept.
- Eric King (he/him) | City Manager for the City of Bend
- Barbara Campbell (she/her/hers) | COBAAC Council Liaison | Councilperson
- Sinclair Burr | Principal Engineer | Engineering & Infrastructure Planning Department
- Racheal Baker (she/her/hers) | Affordable Housing Manager | Affordable Housing Dept.
- Lisa Larsen (she/hers) | Administration Support Specialist Accessibility | DEIA Dept.

2. Land Acknowledgement

Cherissa Alldredge (she/her/hers) | Accessibility and Equity Manager | COBAAC Liaison | City of Bend DEIA

City of Bend Land Acknowledgement:

We would like to acknowledge that the beautiful land known as Bend, Oregon north to the Columbia River is the original homelands of the Confederated Tribes of Warm Springs. The Confederated Tribes ceded this land in the Treaty of 1855 while retaining regular and customary hunting, fishing, and gathering rights. The Wana Łama ([Warm Springs](#)), Wasq'ú (Wasco) and Northern Paiute people inhabited this area in certain seasonal times that clearly established their presence. It is also important to note that the Klamath Trail ran north through this region to the great Celilo Falls trading grounds. This trade route expanded the impact of commerce between Tribal nations. We acknowledge and thank the original stewards of this land. It is our hope that guests continue to honor and care for this land.

3. Approval of Minutes from January 27, 2022, Meeting as Read

Motion to Approve January 27, 2022, minutes: member Hamer approved the motion; members Sparks (she/her) seconded the motion; unanimously approved by the remaining members in attendance.

4. Public Comment

Anna Sones attended:

Comment from Anna and surrounding neighbors about the NW 15th Street Project: Anna's partner, Anna, lives east of the current dirt walkway; they want to let the City know they prefer option 3 of this project. They do not want the dirt walkway made into a street.

Note: Principal Engineer Burr addresses public attendee Sones' concern about adding a street. (Agenda item 6. Discuss Transportation Project Accessibility Best Practices, slide 5)

5. COBAAC Business

Nick Radon | Chair

- Chair Update:

Jeff Lichtenberg: Resigned 2/23/2022 - Appointed 1/2019.

Frank Shirley: Resigned 1/28/2022 - Appointed 8/2020.

Thank you both for your involvement with the City of Bend Accessibility Advisory Committee (COBAAC) and the time spent helping the City of Bend.

- New Member Introductions:

- Amanda Hamer is the Executive Director of Diversity Inc; involved in the diversity community for about 17 years; is a parent of a child born with Down Syndrome; works as a change agent in the community and is grateful to have seen the growth in resources in the community the last 15 plus years.
- John Heylin owns the ax-throwing bar downtown; his dad had polio, he served on the Disability Commission for Santa Cruze, and a big reason John wanted to join COBAAC. When John dated his wife, who was unable to walk, he experienced a lot of looking for accessible spots/areas close to their destination.
- Whitney Bennett Appointment Starts COBAAC in March

- Volunteers for Vice-Chair:

John Heylin volunteered for Vice-Chair. Vote: unanimously approved by the members in attendance of the meeting.

- Winter Access Award (WAA) (COBAAC Snow Removal) Reminder:

COBAAC members take pictures of businesses adhering to the city code for snow removal. Nominations/pictures are accepted until April 2022.

- Stipends:

Equity & Inclusion Director Anna Allen, Accessibility & Equity Manager Cherissa Aldredge, and city staff talked about stipends for committee and commission members.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge let COBAAC know they anticipate being able to provide stipends to committee and commission members beginning in April. They are still working on the administrative details, such as dispersing payments and collecting information. You must choose to opt-in or opt out if you want to participate.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge mentioned that the stipend is to reduce barriers to participation: to pay for internet access, transportation to attend in-person meetings to participate, childcare to participate. That is what the stipend/gap is intended to bridge, and not anticipate stipends to exceed a total of \$600.00 a year.

- Demographic Questionnaire Feedback:

Accessibility & Equity Manager Aldredge and others have been working on a list of draft demographic questions to incorporate into the future application process.

These questions would be optional and answered separately, outside the traditional application process.

Currently, the COBAAC Charter has a goal to have 51 percent of members being folks with disabilities, and there are not a lot of tools to make sure we are being thoughtful and strategic to fill that goal.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge would appreciate feedback from COBAAC membership, via email, about the language we would use around that. Cherissa will email members a draft document outlining what we think those questions might be and wants members to return feedback.

Member Heylin shared past successful outreach: Print business cards with the Accessibility Commission information and how to join the commission, placing it on the car windshield of someone with a disability placard.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge reminded committee members that the use of Google Docs is not permitted and requested all feedback be emailed to her directly.

Before moving forward with recruitments, COBAAC Liaison Alldredge wants to finish the demographic questionnaire to include in the application process.

Member Hamer wants to know if her 18-year-old daughter could join COBAAC; she experiences different challenges with her disability. What kind of support would her daughter need to understand some of the things that would come along? Would it be appropriate for member Hamer to help support her daughter; if the Council thinks this would be beneficial, or one of the daughter's support workers help?

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge suggested that she and member Hamer talk offline about support and what approach may be needed.

- Temporary Review of the COBAAC Charter:
COBAAC Liaison Alldredge talked about business items around the COBAAC Charter, meeting times, and days. We are at a place to consider how the committee wants to provide feedback on potential changes to the charter. A couple of options to consider:

- 1) Discussion at future meetings, the whole body of the meeting
- 2) Talk about adding a temporary subcommittee

Members Schahfer, Hamer, and Heylin agree with option one, dedicating a whole COBAAC meeting to discuss the charter.

Member Sparks (she/her) agrees with options one and two. From experience dedicating a whole meeting does not wind up being enough time.

Member Heylin asked if the City has resources and the availability of someone with experience in writing charters to facilitate the charter discussion.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge: We do have availability as we worked on the agenda for the March meeting. There may be some opportunity to begin talking about the language in the charter. COBAAC Liaison Alldredge invited City Attorney Mary Winters (she/her) to the March meeting to support some of these discussions and follow the appropriate processes.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge confirmed the availability of committee members to attend the March meeting due to it falling on Spring Break. Member Hamer is unable to attend.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge advised the committee to move forward tentatively unless something changes to have a preliminary discussion about the charter, during the March meeting. Based on that experience, we can identify the next steps at that time.

In the interest of time, COBAAC Liaison Alldredge will later talk about meeting time; modality with the recent update with mask mandates in the state of Oregon

ACTION ITEM: COBAAC Liaison Alldredge will email the draft Demographic Questionnaire to COBAAC members for feedback. (DONE 2/25/2022)

ACTION ITEM: COBAAC Liaison Alldredge and member Hamer will talk about the support needed for her daughter to become a COBAAC member.

ACTION ITEMS: COBAAC Liaison Alldredge will talk about meeting time; modality with the recent update with mask mandates in the state of Oregon

6. Discuss Transportation Project Accessibility Best Practices (Slide 1)

Sinclair Burr | Principal Engineer | Engineering & Infrastructure Planning Department

Principal Engineer Burr's job consists of delivering all the projects within the funding realm of the recently passed General Obligation (GO) Bond for Transportation.

Slide 2. Background:

- ~\$20M in funding under the General Obligation Bond (GO Bond) to build portions Key Routes projects
- Implementing two projects in conjunction with the Newport Avenue Improvements project
- Steep hills make achieving compliant accessible routes difficult, especially when also trying to accommodate bike use

Slide 3. Problem Statement

- 14th Street Connection Grade Differential: ~47 feet
- 15th Street Connection Grade Differential: ~27 feet
- Limited funding: \$220,000 total
- Goal: create useful connections for pedestrians and bicycles

Slide 4. Solution #1 Switchback Path

- Accessible to all users
- Minimum length of path
- Over budget
- Difficult to navigate with bikes

(Option #1) Principal Engineer Burr said they wind up with a 550-foot trail that switches back throughout. Concerns: the trail is longer than the most direct way; not know how much use because navigation is difficult with or without a bike; the required handrail for the path costs over \$220,000 k, which is over the total budget. With walls and grading involved, they estimate \$400,00 to \$500,000 for 15th Street alone, and this does not even include 14th Street. This was investigated but may not be one of their preferred options.

Slide 5. Solution #2 Steep Road

- Meets the letter of the law for accessibility
- Extremely steep – 15%-18%
- Less costly than solution #1
- Difficult to use for all users

(Option #2) Principal Engineer Burr mentioned the 2nd option is to put in a very steep road here. There is a provision with the Public Right-of-Way Accessibility Guidelines (PROWAG) to install a sidewalk at the grade of a street. This would not likely fall under our budget and is difficult for all users.

Note: Public comment from Anna Sones; concerns about adding a street. Principal Engineer Burr said the installation of fire gates on either side makes it not accessible for cars but accessible to pedestrians and bikes.

Slide 6. Solution #3 Move Key Route

- The alternate route is accessible to all users
- 14th and 15th Street improvements would not be accessible routes
- Some funding be reallocated to 12th Street, north of Newport to be improved to Portland

(Option #3) Principal Engineer Burr talks about moving the key route to a different location while making minor improvements to the two steep unimproved areas. Most of the funding will go to wayfinding for all users to find this accessible route. As well as supplementing the funding for the Newport Project to tie 12th Street with better infrastructure to Portland Avenue. That is where a lot of funding would go, with the remaining funds spent on the non-accessible routes, 14th, and 15th Street.

Slide 7. Considerations

- The existing key route terminates at Portland Avenue at a much higher elevation than a 12th Street connection
- No existing sidewalks on 15th Street, no plans to add sidewalks
- No significant destinations made more accessible with an extension of 14th Street

Slide 8. Feedback

- Would COBAAC be supportive of a signed alternate route along 15th Street, Kingston Avenue, 13th Street, Milwaukie Avenue, and 12th Street?
- Any further ideas on treatment?
- Discussion on a policy for similar situations?

Q and A

Principal Engineer Burr asked COBAAC members if they were supportive of moving this key route and using some of the money for less-accessible routes. And asked if they have additional input, ideas, or treatment they want to suggest along these routes. Lastly, when situations in the future come up within the GO Bond, with at least one more that will come up within the GO Bond, having a policy in place for these situations would be great to help keep these projects moving along and get the improvements done promptly.

Member Schahfer leans towards option #3; and mentioned that the public attendee Sones is a friend of hers who uses a wheelchair, lives on Milwaukie, and wants to hear her feedback.

Public Attendee Sones: Option #3 makes sense to have an inclusive route for all users, rather than trying to force something inaccessible to be made quasi accessible.

Member Heylin: Option #3 is the path of least resistance and sensible

Chairperson Radon: Does this proposal include signage to highlight the accessible routes? Principal Engineer Burr mentioned the usage of wayfinding, which is a word, for signing and striping. Chairperson Radon: Any thoughts of potentially adding accessible parking at either end of the routes? Principal Engineer Burr: No, that was not contemplated as part of the project.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge asked a question on behalf of member Mohni who was unable to attend the meeting. Member Mohni: I would like to understand more about solution #1, What is the user experience for someone in a mobility device to navigate this type of switchback route, and how much is over budget. Principal Engineer Burr: He cannot say or pretend to know how a person who uses a wheelchair would navigate.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge read aloud: The second piece of feedback from member Mohni, the new route presented in solution #3 provides the necessary connections between Newport and Portland. However, I am concerned about the lack of sidewalks on 15th Street and no plan to add sidewalks soon along our major artery at the accessible route. If this solution is approved, can 15th Street be prioritized by the city for future sidewalk improvements? Principal Engineer Burr: Not with the GO funding. All the projects have already been identified, and the money's spoken for to date. We have money for 100 or 200 feet here and there for sidewalk infill, but we expect that if people wanted to use sidewalks, they would be on 14th Street and low stress, especially for pedestrians.

Principal Engineer Burr will ask the Accessibility Program if he wants or needs a letter of support from COBAAC, for solution #3, otherwise, he will use meeting notes and confer with the Legal Department on what is needed.

7. Fair Housing Assessment Update

Racheal Baker (she/her/hers) | Affordable Housing Manager | City of Bend Affordable Housing

Affordable Housing Manager Baker (she/her) asked for COBAAC volunteers in November of 2021 to help with the Fair Housing Assessment; three COBAAC members volunteered.

Slide 1. City of Bend's Assessment of Fair Housing

Slide 2. Assessment of Fair Housing

- The city of Bend Receives Funding Through the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Program
 - CDBG communities must analyze impediments to fair housing every five years and set goals toward rectifying exclusionary housing practices discovered
- The city of Bend Required to Affirmatively Further Fair Housing under the Fair Housing Act of 1968
- Protected Classes Under Fair Housing Act of 1968, Oregon's Fair Housing Law, and City of Bend Code
 - Race
 - Color
 - Religion
 - Gender
 - Familial Status
 - National Origin
 - Disability
 - Sexual Orientation
 - Marital Status
 - Survivors of Domestic Violence
 - Source of Income
 - Age
- Five-Year Update to Assessment of Fair Housing Due (formerly known as the Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing)

- Examines housing barriers to protected classes in Bend
- Incorporates best practices to remove housing barriers and rectify housing inequities

Affordable Housing Manager Baker said it is required under the Fair Housing Act for us to maintain receipt of community development, block grant funding, which we use to help support and fund all kinds of Affordable Housing Development and community development and services in the community. Fair Housing law requires that you know we assess every 5 years the barriers to housing with regards to protected classes.

I am here to talk about community participation, with the results of that communication, bringing our draft nearer to completion soon.

Slide 3. Community Participation

- 20+ Community Organization Consultations
- City Committees Consultations
 - Affordable Housing Advisory Committee
 - Human Rights and Equity Commission
 - Accessible Advisory Committee
- In-person discussions with served community members at Cascade Youth and Family Center and Family Kitchen
- Online Survey (874 Participants)

Affordable Housing Manager Baker said unfortunately, we did not have the opportunity to do a lot of in-person consultations which restricted who we had access to and how many people we had access to, and will not be as comprehensive as I would have liked with regards to our community participation.

We make efforts to have an in-person decision with some of our more vulnerable populations.

Slide 4. Race of Online Survey Participants

This bar graph shows the race each online survey participant identified - seventy-nine percent were White or Caucasian, one percent were Black or African American, two percent were Asian, one percent were American Indian or Alaskan Native, and less than one percent were Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander.

- 79.92 Percent White or Caucasian
- 1.84 Percent Black or African American
- 2.40 Percent Asian
- 1.56 Percent American Indian or Alaska Native
- 0.57 Percent Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander

Affordable Housing Manager Baker showed some visuals of who participated in the online survey. That is not the entirety of how we will shape the assessment or the goals that come out of the Fair Housing Assessment, because it was skewed. We had the typical population, with most white and Caucasian community members participating.

Slide 5. Ethnicity of Online Participants

This pie chart provides the percentage of online survey participants who identified as Hispanic - seven percent identified as Hispanic and ninety-three percent identified as non-Hispanic.

- 7 Percent Hispanic
- 93 Percent Non-Hispanic (Majority)

Slide 6. Housing Circumstances of Survey Participants

This pie chart illustrates the housing circumstances of the online survey participants - sixty percent owned their home, thirty-two percent rented their home from a private property owner, four percent rented a rent-restricted apartment, and other four percent were houseless.

- 32 Percent Renter from Private Landlord
- 4 Percent Renter from Rent-Restricted Apartment
- 4 Percent Houseless
- 60 Percent Home Owners (Majority)

Slide 7. Community Responses – Housing Choice

- Most vulnerable populations expressed a desire for safe and accessible transitional housing types - where their valuables could be secured, where access to personal hygiene needs to be provided, where garbage receptacles and regular collection occurred, where they felt safe from others, and where they felt a sense of community with support
- Service providers for such vulnerable populations requested removing land use or other design standard prohibitions and allowing for increased accessible transitional housing types, such as recreational vehicles (RVs), manufactured homes, micro-units, and shelter villages
- A desire for increased Permanent Supportive Housing (PSH)
- Need for more middle housing type development – duplex, triplex, fourplex, micro-units, cottages, and townhomes
- More affordable housing of all types - **both** rental and homeownership opportunities
- Reframe housing policy with more human-centered objectives

Affordable Housing Manager Baker said that was the general theme we gathered from the responses received to compile our assessment of Fair Housing in our community.

Slide 8. Community Responses – Complete Communities

- Greater Accessible Connectivity and Safety Enforcement
 - Better marked crosswalks
 - Eliminate dead-end sidewalks
 - More bike lanes
- Housing Availability in All Neighborhoods
 - For all age ranges
 - Accessible and inclusive to everyone
 - Balanced zoning in all neighborhoods for integrated schools and broad access to community amenities

- Increased Transportation Options
 - Greater access to public transportation with more routes and hours of availability
 - Safe spaces to access public transportation
- Employment Opportunities Closer to Home
 - Wages aligned with the cost of living in the neighborhood of the workplace
 - Reduced commute
- More Social Services Access
 - Expandability for social service providers to engage community members in need and serve them at locations throughout Bend
 - Increase capacity for social service providers to communicate unmet needs of service to services' funders and community
 - Reduce complex intake systems for the benefits of services

Affordable Housing Manager Baker said they want complete communities with greater access; not just to social services in one part of town, but throughout the town to access services where they live. Affordable Housing Manager Baker said the draft of the Fair Housing Assessment will consist of all the information compiled.

Slide 9. Assessment of Fair Housing – Goals and Priorities

- Draft Assessment of Fair Housing
- Identifies and Prioritizes Contributing Factors (and those City cannot address)
 - Limited Housing Choice
 - Minimal Community Organization
- Provides City Goals for Fair Housing Issue
- Metrics and Milestones

Affordable Housing Manager Baker mentioned they are going to provide the city with some goals for fair housing issues. Those goals will require metrics and milestones, and be incorporated in the City's Consolidated Plan, a five-year strategic plan developing over the next year on how our Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Program funds are prioritized, where they go, and what investments are made in the City of Bend.

Slide 10. Questions?

Racheal Baker | Affordable Housing Manager | Email rbaker@bendoregon.gov

8. Accessibility and Equity Manager Update

Cherissa Alldredge (she/her/hers) | Accessibility and Equity Manager | COBAAC Liaison | City of Bend DEIA

COBAAC Liaison & Accessibility & Equity Manager Alldredge: Related to our discussion about improvements, streets, as many of you know, we are making improvements along Newport Street; we are working to improve accessibility for the community to understand what that temporary pedestrian access will sound like, look like, and what they will experience. You will start to see text descriptions on the city's website, explaining how to navigate the area, in addition to images. As we start to roll out the 2 segments, look at that information, if you get a chance. Feel free to share any feedback about the utility of that.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge mentioned to the committee discussing the updates to the city's ADA Transition Plan in April.

9. Updates from the City Manager's Office

Eric King (he/him) | City Manager | City of Bend

City Manager King is here to listen, track the committee's work, and interact with the City of Bend Accessibility Advisory Committee members.

City Manager King mentioned the importance of future work on the COBAAC Charter, appreciating the members' questions and engagement earlier in the meeting. He views the charter as one of the most important things you can do as a committee. It is how you govern, especially in these times right now; committees need solid processes to move through difficult issues. City Manager King encouraged the committee members' participation in updating the COBAAC Charter. We have resources, our city attorney's office, and others (Committees, Boards, Commissions) that have gone through this process to help.

City Manager King will attend the April meeting to talk about how boards and committees integrate into how the city operates; basic city 101 on core services; some of the goals we are working on, and your engagement in some of those broader efforts.

10. COBAAC Councilmember Liaison Comments

Barbara Campbell (she/her/hers) | Council Member

COBAAC Councilmember Campbell updated the committee on last month's Central Oregon Commission for Access (COCA) meeting and COCA member Wills who is blind.

COCA member Wills shared her troubling story about her travels from her apartment to her mailbox in the Fred Meyer parking lot, across the street. COCA member Wills found herself disoriented, in the middle of the Fred Meyer parking lot and not knowing how to get out. Thankfully, someone offered COCA member Wills a ride to her apartment.

This story was brought to light in COCA member Will's situation where both the surrounding private businesses around her apartment and the Fred Meyer parking lot sidewalks were torn up and not accessible.

COBAAC Councilmember Campbell poses the question in the case of COCA member Wills, how might she have gained access to information about inaccessible sidewalks, especially where some were inaccessible private sidewalks. City Manager King?

City Manager King shared the information about how to subscribe and receive [Weekly Road and Traffic Reports](#) via email.

COBAAC Councilmember Campbell's update on Neighborhood Associations, mild snowfall, and help shoveling snow from homeowners' driveways and sidewalks. We may be able to help connect you with a volunteer through our Neighborhood Associations.

Member Heylin: Are there rules and timelines for private property owners to repair their sidewalks? City Manager King: Permits have a window. The challenge is with the current issues with labor and supplies, so projects take longer than they have historically taken.

COBAAC Councilmember Campbell shared the information with the Program Manager for Events & Volunteer Cheryl Howard 541-388-5579, at the request of member Schahfer to ask for snow removal volunteers for residential homes.

Chair member Radon: Is there a way for us to target specific locations; memory care, assisted living, people with limited mobility or abilities to provide them the information on sidewalk closures affecting their access.

COBAAC Liaison Alldredge wanted to clarify what Chair member Radon was asking: Are you looking to see if we have an opportunity to seek out folks to share the information with who might benefit from potential sidewalk and road closures; share specific information or seek them out to let them know the resources exist? Chair member Radon's reply: Both. COBAAC Liaison Alldredge will do research on this subject and come report back at meeting in the future, with what options to make going forward.

ACTION ITEM: COBAAC Liaison Alldredge will research outreach concerning shared information with inaccessible sidewalks and street closures for targeted areas; memory care, assisted living, and areas with limited mobility or abilities.

11. Future COBAAC Meeting Agenda Ideas

Member Schafer has had conversations with a couple of businesses about snow removal and trying to get on board with the importance of personal business owners removing their snow accumulation from sidewalks and parking lots, being it is their responsibility. She wants to have a conversation to help private businesses, and coordinate snow removal, beyond the immediate things that the businesses can do.

Member Hamer wants to know if there needs to be further conversation placement of resources related to access or if there is a need to continue the conversation. Member Schahfer is curious if this would crossover into the committee conversation about COBAAC responsibilities and our initiatives under the charter at the next meeting.

ACTION ITEM: Add Private Business Owners Snow Removal to a future agenda.

12. Adjourn (2:30 pm)

The motion to adjourn the meeting at 2:30 PM was unanimously approved by all that attend

The Next COBAAC Meeting is on March 24, 2022, | from 1:00 pm to 2:30 pm

Respectfully submitted by: Lisa Larsen, Administrative Support Specialist Accessibility Program



Accessible in Alternate Format Notification:

The City of Bend is committed to ensuring that public meetings are accessible. Accommodations such as sign language interpreter services, assistive listening devices, materials in an alternate format such as Braille, large print, or electronic formats, or other accommodations needed to ensure equal access due to a disability are available upon advance request at no cost. Please submit accommodation requests to the Accessibility Program at accessibility@bendoregon.gov, or call 541-693-2798, or TTY 541-312-8478 at least two business days in advance of the meeting, preferably three days to ensure availability.