

Human Rights and Equity Commission

January 31, 2024, Regular Meeting Minutes

Commissioner Linda Long conducted and called the Bend Human Rights and Equity Commission, January 31, 2024, regular hybrid meeting to order at 4:31 PM, in Council Chambers at City Hall, 710 NW Wall Street, 97703. Watch the **January 31, 2024, livestream recording**.

1. Roll Call: Commissioners.

- Chair Manoj Alipuria, He/Him (*Absent – Excused*).
 - Vice Chair Joanne Mina, She/Her (*Absent – Excused*).
 - Cameron Fischer, She/Her, (*Virtual*).
 - Carly Colgan, She/Her, (*In-Person*).
 - Carolyn Peacock-Biggs, She/Her, (*In-Person*).
 - Christopher Foltz, He/Him, (*Virtual*).
 - Jackie Currie, She/They, (*In-Person*).
 - Jasmine Wilder, She/Her, (*Absent – Excused*).
 - Jeff Kitchens, He/Him, (*In-Person*).
 - Linda Long, She/Her, (*Virtual*).
 - Stephen Sehgal, He//Him (*Absent – Last Meeting*).
 - Nancy Stevens, She/Her/Hers (*Absent – Excused*).
- = 4 In-Person, 3 Virtual, and 5 Absences Excused.

City Staff:

- Cassandra Kehoe, She/Her/Ella, Accessibility and Equity Manager // HREC Staff Liaison.
- Andrés Portela, He/Him, Equity & Inclusion Director.
- Stephanie Betteridge, She/Her, Assistant City Manager // Chief Innovation Officer.
- Megan Perkins, She/Her, Mayor Pro Tem // HREC Council Liaison.
- Ian Leitheiser, He/Him, Assistant City Attorney
- Robin Lewis, She/Her, Transportation Engineer.

Public Comment:

- Jim, no last name given. Left a comment.
- Johann Helf: Left a comment.
- Colleta Macy, She/Her: Left a comment.
- Foster Fell: Left a comment.
- Jacob Yozamp: Left a comment.
- Renee LeBlanc: No comment.
- Barb Campbell: No comment.

2. Land Acknowledgment: Commissioner Kitchens read in English & Commissioner Long in Spanish.

3. Minutes Approval: Approve December 13, 2023, Meeting Minutes.

Motion: Commissioner Peacock-Biggs motioned to approve the HREC December 13, 2023, Draft Minutes as read, with no corrections. Commissioner Jeff Kitchens seconded the motion. The motion to approve the December 13, 2023, unanimously passed by all voting members who attended today's meeting, in person (4) and virtually (3).

4. HREC Onboarding:

4.1. New HREC Member Introductions

- a. Jackie Currie: Lived in Bend since 2017, with a little hiatus to Klamath Falls and moved back to Bend. She is a mixed person and enrolled in the Puyallup tribe of Indians based in Tacoma, Washington. She is showing up with this identity and with those concerns. A friend of Jackie's encouraged her look into this commission, and she became really interested. Jackie said she has a lot of different intersecting identities.
- b. Nancy Stevens (*absent until March*)

5. Public Comment:

- Jim, no last name given, (In-Person), resident: Urges HREC to follow the lead of San Francisco, Oakland, Richmond, Bridgman, Wilmington, Detroit, Dearborn, Albany, Akron, Providence, and other local governments that have already passed resolutions to support an immediate and complete ceasefire in Gaza. Jim brought this message to the City Council and is urging HREC to support Bend residents who are behind this ceasefire.
- Johann Helf, He/Him (virtual) resident: He is of Jewish descent, his parents met on a kibbutz in Israel, and his great-grandparents escaped the ghetto in Eastern Europe and came to the U.S. The rest of his family exterminated in the Holocaust.

Johann is horrified by the genocide war crimes and the ethnic cleansing perpetuated by the Israeli government against the Palestinians. The USA has defunded UNRWA (United Nations Relief and Works Agency), the only organization providing aid to the people of GAZA.

Johann requests and begs HREC to pressure City Council to pass a resolution, calling for a permanent ceasefire, which will cost nothing.

- Colleta Macy: A tribal citizen of the Warm Springs and Wasco Tribes. Is an Indigenous person, her existence is her resistance. She stands with her Indigenous relatives, friends, and family of Palestine. There is a genocide happening and Colletta is asking HREC to demand a ceasefire in Gaza and humanitarian aid to enter Gaza freely.
- Foster Fell: Foster Fell: Support of Vice-Chair Mina and her efforts to bring a ceasefire in Gaza. A resolution before you for your consideration. Foster said it is an honor to speak before you about Vice-Chair Mina. Foster first experienced her courage and morality at a candlelight vigil, encouraging the community to speak out against a policy of family separation at the border. Foster spoke of why HREC should consider Vice-Chair Mina's ceasefire resolution. Due to little Congressional representative representation from Bend and Central Oregon.
- Jacob Yozamp: Attended the HREC meeting to see and hear what this is all about.

6. HREC November and December 2024 Meeting Dates:

6.1. November 13, 2024 (Rather than November 27, 2024)

Roll Call Vote Results: Unanimously passed by all voting members who attended today's meeting, in person (4) and virtually (3)

6.2. December 11, 2024 (Rather than December 25, 2024)

Roll Call Vote Results: Unanimously passed by all voting members who attended today's meeting, in person (4) and virtually (3)

7. Neighborhood Street Safety Program: Robin Lewis, She/Her/Hers, Transportation Engineer.

Slide 1: Neighborhood Street Safety Program Presentation for the City of Bend Accessibility Advisory Committee.

Slide 2: Neighborhood Street Safety Program Projects.

Established in 2019 and Build SMALL projects that increase safety and connect people to places.

- 17 projects 2020 to 2023
 - Arterial Crosswalks
 - Neighborhood Traffic Safety
 - Sidewalk infill project
- Eight Projects in Design for Construction in 2024:
 - Sidewalk Infill
 - Local Street Crossing

Slide 3: Examples from 2020-2023 Neighborhood Street Safety Program.

- Marked crosswalks with a safety island in the middle of the street, where students cross, and school zone crosswalk signs are present.

Slide 4: Neighborhood Street Safety Program – Phase 1 Post Program Evaluation.

- Good geographic coverage:
 - Strict adherence to 2 projects per NA restricted ability to choose highest need projects (points) but did work to find lower income and atypical inputs from school families.
 - Round 2 will not be restricted by NA boundaries, points play a larger role.
 - Adding more points for equity.
- Shift focus to constructing planned walk/bike network.
 - Add more points for network connectivity, completion of route.

Slide 5: Neighborhood Street Safety Program 2025-2030. Phase 2 Criteria.

- Connections:
 - SRTS or SRTP.
 - Infill Pedestrian Master Plan sidewalk.
 - Connect Bend Bikeway Routes and Trails.
- Arterial Crosswalk Enhancement:
 - Difficult crossings of an arterial or collector that cause a barrier to walk or biking for an everyday transportation need, like school, park, or getting to work.

- Local Residential Streets:
 - That are on the Bend Bikeways Network, or have a street recognized by ND as having safety, speed, or volume issues.

Slide 6: 2025 to 2030 Budget.

- \$3,900,000:
 - Planning Level Construction Cost Estimate - \$2,437,500.
 - Construction Contingency 30% - \$731,250.
 - Design Estimate 30% - \$731,250.

Slide 7: Potential to Increase Equity - Criteria.

- Equity - Transportation Disadvantage: (3 Points >1.6%), (2 Points >1.4%), (1 Point >1.2%), ODOT's Index (includes transit accessibility).
- Equity - 200% or less of FPL: (3 Points >45%), (2 Points 3.51 to 45%), (1 Point 24.7 to 35%), Population percentage living on 200% or less than the federal poverty level.
- Equity - Zero Car Ownership Households: (3 Points >15%), (2 Points >10%), (1 Point 5 to 10%), Population percentage living without a car.
- Equity - Disability: (3 Points >15%), (2 Points 9.9 to 15%), (1 Point 5 to 9.9%), Population percentage living with a disability.

Slide 8: More details on TDI.

This is a clip showing the ODOT formula for calculating Transportation Disadvantaged Index: $TDP\ Index = \frac{Eld + Yth + NH + LEP + Pov + (HH * Veh * 2.5) + Dis}{Population}$.

- Eld = Number of residents over 65.
- Yth = Number of residents under 18.
- NH = Number of residents who identify as non-white or Hispanic.
- LEP = Number of residents that speak English "not well," or "not at all."
- Pov = Number of residents with income under 200% of poverty level.
- HH = Average Oregon household size.
- Veh = Number of residents with 0 vehicles.
- Dis = Number of residents with a disability.
- Pop = Total population

Poverty, zero vehicles, and disabilities are baked into the TDI. But using them as separate criteria is also important because they are washed out in the TDI because there are so many other factors. (see map examples).

Slide 9: DTI versus Disabilities, Zero Cars, and Poverty.

- Transportation Disadvantage Index: The areas in the city with the highest TDI are located just west and just east of Pilot Butte.
- Disabilities (the Bend Metropolitan Planning Organization's "Disabilities" mapping): There are more residents with disabilities and span in a SW to NE line concentrations near Reed Market and the Parkway, Colorado Interchange, and Pilot Butte and areas near St. Charles Hospital.
- Zero Car Ownership: Areas are concentrated all around Pilot Butte and extending significantly to the west to the Deschutes River.

- 200% Federal Poverty Level: The highest concentrations of poverty are to the south and southwest of Pilot Butte extending to the Deschutes River and running along Greenwood Avenue, as well as along Purcell Boulevard.

Slide 10: Potential to Reduce VMT / Build Network - Criteria.

- Network Importance:
 - 3 Points: Builds a portion of the LSN or Connects LSN routes.
 - 2 Points: Connects to or extends an LSN or trail route.
 - 1 Point: Closes a sidewalk or bikeway gap or adds a non-LSN crosswalk.
 - How to measure: City's TSP LSN Mapping.
- School or Park:
 - 3 Points: Less than ¼ mile.
 - 2 Points: Within ½ mile.
 - 1 Point: Within 1 mile.
 - How to measure: GIS Mapping.

Slide 11: Potential to Improve Safety - Criteria.

- Crash Reduction:
 - 3 points: Previous K or A Injury crashes.
 - 2 Points: Previous B or C injury crashes.
 - 1 Point: Previous PDO crashes.
 - How to Measure: ODOT Crash Data 2015-2020.
- Crash Reduction - Walk or Bike:
 - 3 Points: Previous K or A Injury crashes (walk or bike).
 - 2 Points: Previous B or C injury crashes (walk or bike).
 - 1 Point: Previous PDO crashes (walk or bike).
 - How to Measure: ODOT Crash Data 2015-2020.
- Speeds:
 - 3 Points: (Arterials: Posted speed >35), (Locals: field >30).
 - 2 Points: (Arterials: Posted speed 35 mph), (Locals: field >25).
 - 1 Point: (Arterials: Posted speed 30 mph), (Locals: field <25).
 - How to Measure: (Arterials: speed zone order - note: if posted 25 = 0 pts), (Locals: existing radar value or field measure by neighborhood).
- Volumes:
 - 3 Points: (Arterials: >9,000 ADT), (Locals: >1500).
 - 2 Points: (Arterials: 5k to 9k ADT), (Locals: 1000 to 1500).
 - 1 Point: (Arterials: <5,000 ADT), (Locals: 500 to 1000).
 - How to Measure: Reports or 15-minute field measures.

Slide 12: Potential to Maximize Projects - Cost Criteria.

- Cost Estimate:
 - 3 Points: Project less than \$100,000.
 - 2 Points: Projects between \$100,000 and \$200,000.
 - 1 Point: Project between \$200,000 and \$300,000.
 - How to Measure: Staff Cost Estimate based on recent bid analyses.

Slide 13: Project Development and Selection.

- Potential Initiated:
 - Pedestrian Master Plan.
 - Crashes (ODOT) database)
 - TSP Low Stress Network.
 - Existing CIP, GO Bond, and Private Development – gaps.
 - Concepts created and screened for constructability.
- Neighborhood District Initiated.
 - Speeding and safety issues within neighborhoods.
 - Concepts created and screened for constructability.
- Projects Evaluated using Evaluation Criteria and Points assigned.

Slide 14: 2025 to 2020 Program Schedule.

- Fall:
 - Open House with NA Board Members.
 - Interactive Map.
 - Project Criteria.
 - Initial Project List Review.
- Winter:
 - NA Board will review the Initial Project List with members.
 - Solicit approval or identify up to two additional projects that they want the community to consider for inclusion on Round 2 NSSP.
 - Staff create sketch level concepts and cost estimates for any added projects.
 - Internal staff review of concepts.
 - Update Interactive Map.
 - ND’s review projects and community ranking of projects.
 - Equity Outreach: Human Rights and Equity Commission and City of Bend Accessibility Advisory Committee.

Transportation Engineer Lewis asked HREC Commissioners to send any input about today’s presentation to her by April 15, 2024. Commissioners, please email Accessibility and Equity Manager if you have any questions or if you want the updated ODOT information.

8. HREC: Stipend Review and Recommendation Workshop 1: Stephanie Betteridge, She/Her, Assistant City Manager, Chief Innovation Officer.

This will be an interactive workshop where commissioners can share ideas.

Objectives.

- Gain a common understanding of the Stipend Program
- Develop a recommendation for Council that takes into account:
 - Survey results.
 - Insight from HREC.
 - Tax and insurance considerations.

Stipend Background: 2021-2023 Council Goal. Accessible and Effective Government.

Goal: Meet the diverse and changing needs of the community and build connection between community members and City government by providing services in ways that work for everyone, build public trust, and promote civic engagement.

- Expand opportunities for community members to connect with the city.
- Lower barriers to engagement and improve access.

Action: Provide a stipend of offset incurred costs of participating on a City advisory committee, board, or commission. At the same time, implement a strategy to capture demographic information to ensure we are able to tell the story of who is participating to ensure the stipend program is serving communities who we want to hear from.

- Stipend Program adopted by Council in 2022, launched in July 2022.
 - Evaluation and refinement after first year.
- Intended to offset related expenses such as internet (for remote meeting participation), parking, and transportation.
 - Not compensation for time.
 - Members serve as volunteers, not employees of the City.
- \$40 per meeting (regular and subcommittee meetings), not to exceed \$500 annually per person, regardless of the number of committees an individual serves on
- All advisory group members are eligible but may opt out.
- Applies to permanent committees.
- Disbursement is by cash cards, provided at each meeting or mailed.
- The option for mailed checks will be available if requested by a committee member.

Stipend Survey: High level findings (Issued in October 2023).

- Everyone who took the survey has heard of the stipend program.
- Only 3 knew about it before applying to a board.
- Signing up and receiving debit cards is seen as easy or very easy, while using the debit cards is seen as very difficult, difficult or neutral by slightly more than half of respondents.
- Helping. With the cost of transportation and Internet were the most common responses to impact. Of the stipend.
- People who opted out of the stipends were still generally favorable/positive about the stipend program.

Stipend Survey: What is working well.

- I think it is a good way to ensure that anyone in the community who wants to participate can because they are compensated for their time.
- It is a great program, super easy to attain and use, much appreciated.
- Getting it in the mail.
- The ease of receipt and use of the stipend. The debit card is received quickly after meeting attendance and is easy to use.
- It is great to be recognized.
- It is nice to get a monetary recognition of the time spent preparing and participating in meetings.
- It is easy to receive them, and I appreciate it, given the amount of time spent on all related work for being on the committee.
- I think it feels like a nice thank you and I always use them for all kinds of things.
- It provides the opportunity for me to pay for parking if needed and when attending remotely allows me to purchase and/or offset the cost of lunch for myself if the meeting is during the lunch hour.

What would you like changed:

- Debit cards are difficult to use, requiring activation and a different PIN for each one, and they only seem to work at some vendors. Their expiration date has also been difficult to comply with.
- No plastic cards! I'm on the ECC and its creating so much unnecessary waste (and they are hard to use). Can we find a different option that's direct deposit or digital?
- I would like to see reusable cards and less physical mail.
- Needs to be codified. it's sad that we left it out of the HREC code.
- I would prefer \$40 check or direct deposit than debit card. Save the plastic.
- The gift cards are very difficult. Many (most) places don't take them/they don't work with their card system. You have to be precise in your spending because they don't work if you try to pay for something that is more than they hold. If you have \$7 on a card, you have to keep the purchase under \$7. If you try to buy something over that the card is declined.
- I have a couple of ideas: Offering to have your stipend be used to help other members who may have greater needs? Offering scaled amounts giving members a choice regarding how much would benefit them?
- A direct-deposit option to receive the stipend in my bank account would be nice.
- I would rather receive just one card for the entire term, with automatic monthly deposits, than receive a new card every month.
- I would prefer to get one card per quarter. I've got so many cards that require activation and then to keep track of that it would be much easier to only have to manage 4 per year.
- Would appreciate if stipend cards had chips like a normal cc card does.
- Nothing. I think it is great.
- I think a reloadable card could be cool & obviously an increase if possible.
- The only issues I've run into are with the way the debit card itself works - some kind of fee leading to uncertain balances on the cards, and occasionally brief windows before cards expire. It would be nice to have to worry about fees, though I'm not sure if that's possible!
- The whole debit card thing is clunky. They depreciate over time, and they can't be used everywhere. I've had them rejected multiple times. And even when they work I end up with multiple cards with a couple of dollars on them. A refillable debit card that could work everywhere would be greatly appreciated.

Additional Feedback:

- I think the stipend program is a great opportunity to help defer costs and make the board process more accessible- If it isn't shown in this survey I wouldn't be surprised as it is just one step, and it takes many steps to make boards accessible. I don't take advantage of the stipend; however, I really dislike prepaid credit cards as a payment requirement. I always end up not using them, or leaving a balance because it feels like they are designed to make it hard to use and or check balance. I am not sure if these are that way, but I was concerned when I saw that as a payment option.
- I think it is important to offer and appreciate it being available.
- I believe the program is important, it should continue.
- It didn't feel right to take it. Perhaps if there was an expense (childcare, transportation or similar) it could be reimbursed instead of a stipend to everyone.
- Thank you for offering this stipend. It's very generous.

Stipend Amounts: Volunteer Protections.

- 42 USC Ch. 139: VOLUNTEER PROTECTION.
- \$500 limit/year.

The term "volunteer" means an individual performing services for a nonprofit organization or a governmental entity who does not receive—

- (A) compensation (other than reasonable reimbursement or allowance for expenses actually incurred); or
- (B) any other thing of value in lieu of compensation, in excess of \$500 per year, and such term includes a volunteer serving as a director, officer, trustee, or direct service volunteer.

Ian Leitheiser, Assistant City Attorney

Brainstorm/Discussion:

Commissioners that attended in-person and virtually took 15 minutes to answer the following questions:

- Based on the survey results and your experience, is the stipend program meeting the objectives?
 - Lowering Barriers to Participation
 - Bringing Diverse Perspectives into City groups
- How do we increase awareness ahead of time, so that we are meeting the intent?
- What are additional barriers to participation?
- Ways to improve the stipend payments?
- What other suggestions/things we have not considered?

Commissioners placed their answers on a Post-it and facilitators placed the virtual attendees' answers on a poster board in Council Chambers.

Assistant Manager Betteridge will summarize the answers and commissioner's recommendations, do additional research, complete an evaluation, and present her finding at the February 28, 2024, HREC meeting.

- HREC develops a recommendation in February.
- Present recommendation to Council in March.
- Update the policy and conduct outreach and communication.

9. Community Events and Updates:

9.1. HREC Invitation: Black History Month Proclamation at City Council Meeting, Kathi Barguil

Black History Month Proclamation: HREC Invitation.

Join City Council for the reading of this year's Black History Month proclamation, written with the guidance and feedback from Black community leaders including The Father's Group, Central Oregon Earthseeds and Africans and Friends of Central Oregon.

Date: February 7, 2024, at start of the City Council Meeting

Time: Start of the City Council Meeting (Time TBD)

9.2. HREC Roundtable:

For the good of the group moving forward these two items will be on future agendas.

- a. HREC Commissioners are welcome to share upcoming events and programs.
- b. HREC Commissioners are also welcome to email Accessibility and Equity Manager // HREC Staff Liaison Kehoe any invitations that you would like to send to all members.

10. HREC Workplan: Cassandra Kehoe, She/Her/Ella, Accessibility and Equity Manager & HREC Staff Liaison.

Due to the length of the Public Comment section and two presentations at today's meeting, time ran out for the HREC Workplan section of the agenda.

- 10.1. HREC Workplan, Andrés Portela, He/Him, Equity & Inclusion Director.
- 10.2. Subcommittees – Next Meetings.

11. HREC Council Liaison Update: Megan Perkins, She/Her, Mayor Pro Tem.

Due to the length of the Public Comment section and two presentations at today's meeting, time ran out for the HREC Liaison Update section of this agenda.

12. HREC Agenda Setting: HREC Guidelines - Protocol Review.

SECTION VIII – HREC TOPICS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Topics for Consideration

- a) Topics for HREC consideration shall be guided by Council Goals and the Commission's action plan, as outlined in the HREC code (a plan to achieve an equitable society, responsive to the evolving needs and priorities of marginalized and underrepresented communities in Bend, engaging with Bend community members, interested groups, other agencies, City staff, and businesses and nonprofits to develop strategies to promote diversity, equity and inclusion goals). This plan, once developed, should be presented to Council for approval, with Council advised on implementation, progress, and updates to the plan as needed.
- b) In general, the HREC should use the Council goal setting process to set their work and then use the quarterly update process if the HREC believes there is an issue that needs to be addressed in order to seek Council support.
- c) Other topics for consideration may be brought forward by Commission members, City Council, City staff, provided that they are consistent with Council direction and the purpose of the HREC as set forth in City Code. Only the City Council has the authority to direct the HREC to consider a particular topic.
- d) The HREC, including its subcommissions and working groups, may request input from City staff, subject matter experts, community stakeholders and/or consultants in considering issues, subject to availability and budget considerations.
- e) HREC members may bring suggested agenda items forward consistent with this section during a meeting for consideration by all to be included in a future meeting. Suggested items that have a majority vote of HREC members present, can be included in a future meeting. HREC members may also suggest agenda topics to the chair by e-mail up to one week before a meeting and the item may be added at the Chair's discretion.

Accessibility and Equity Manager // HREC Staff Liaison Kehoe will email the slides to the commissioners, and she brought copies to share at this meeting.

13. Adjourn: With no further HREC business, Commissioner Long adjourned the January 31, 2024, Human Rights and Equity Commission hybrid meeting at 6:32 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa Larsen
Accessibility Administrative Support Staff



Accommodation Information for People with Disabilities

To obtain this information in an alternate format such as Braille, large print, electronic formats, etc., please contact the Accessibility and Equity Manager Cassandra Kehoe at ckehoe@bendoregon.gov or call 541-693-2141. Relay Users Dial 7-1-1.

Para solicitar copias en español de los documentos en esta página web o en un formato alternativo como Braille, letra grande, formatos electrónicos, etc.:

Por favor contacte al Director de Equidad e Inclusión, Andrés Portela aportela@bendoregon.gov o llame al 541-323-8563. Los usuarios de retransmisión marquen el 7-1-1.